## STAFF REPORT

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Agenda Item:** | 9 | **Name:** | Tillery Williams |
| **Proposed No**.: | 2019-0460 | **Date:** | February 12, 2020 |

**SUBJECT**

A motion acknowledging receipt of a report evaluating the department of adult and juvenile detention corrections and juvenile detention officer hiring incentive pilot program in compliance with the 2019-2020 Biennial Budget Ordinance, Ordinance 18835, Section 52, Proviso P3.

**SUMMARY**

Section 52, Proviso P3 of Ordinance 18835[[1]](#footnote-1), the 2019-2020 adopted biennial budget, requires the Executive to transmit a report evaluating the Department of Adult and Juvenile Detention’s (DAJD) corrections and juvenile detention officer hiring incentive pilot program for new corrections and juvenile detention officers.

The 2019-2020 adopted biennial budget appropriated a total of $519,000 for the hiring incentive pilot program. The proviso requires that Council pass a motion acknowledging receipt of the report in order to release $100,000 of provisoed funds to DAJD. The proposed motion, if passed by Council, would fulfill the proviso requirement.

Council staff is working with DAJD to gather outstanding information related to 2019 performance incentive data and determined that the transmitted report generally meets the requirements of the proviso.

**BACKGROUND**

As stated by the Executive in the proviso report, “DAJD has struggled over the past few years to fill vacant Corrections Officer and Juvenile Detention Officer positions. Officer vacancies have consistently been identified as a contributor to high levels of overtime. With historically low unemployment in the Puget Sound Region and nationwide challenges to public safety sector hiring, the Executive was searching for creative ways to fill vacant officer positions. One proposed solution was to offer hiring incentives, similar to those offered in other local law enforcement agencies.” In an effort to fill vacant positions, a hiring incentive pilot program was included in the adopted 2019-2020 biennial budget ($269,000 allocation) enabling hiring incentives for Corrections and Juvenile Detention Officers.

The adopted 2019-2020 biennial budget included a proviso which read:

*Of this appropriation, $100,000 shall not be expended or encumbered until the executive transmits a report evaluating the department of adult and juvenile detention's corrections and juvenile detention officer hiring incentive pilot program for new corrections and juvenile detention officers and a motion that should acknowledge receipt of the report and reference the subject matter, the proviso's ordinance, ordinance section and proviso number in both the title and body of the motion, and a motion acknowledging receipt of the report is passed by the council.*

*The report shall include, but not be limited to:*

1. *A description of the incentives provided through the program, to include "lateral hires," "new hires" and referral bonuses, and how the department identified those individuals who were eligible for the program incentives;*
2. *A description of how the department advertised the program;*
3. *For January 1, 2019, through September 30, 2019, the number of people who received each incentive, broken down to show laterals, new hires and referral bonuses;*
4. *To the extent possible, data for January 1, 2018, through December 31, 2018, showing the number of applicants who had previous corrections or law enforcement experience and would have been considered "lateral hires," the number of applicants who would have been be considered "new hires" and the number from each group who reached the benchmarks that would have made them eligible for incentives had the program been in place;*
5. *To the extent possible, data for January 1, 2018, through December 31, 2018, showing the number of applicants who were referred by a department employee, and the number from each group who reached the benchmarks that would have made the referring department employee eligible for incentives had the program been in place;*
6. *A description of the metrics that the department used to evaluate program performance for the report. The measures shall include, but not be limited to, an evaluation of program cost-effectiveness to include: the program cost per participant; the department's estimate of the impact of the program on department's vacancy rate and use of regular and mandatory overtime for the same time period based on a comparison to 2018 data; and an evaluation of any other potential avoided system costs resulting from hiring individuals eligible for the program incentives; and*
7. *The executive's recommendation of whether the program should continue in 2020. If the program is recommended to be continued, the report shall provide a program cost estimate for 2020 and any recommended changes to make the program more effective.*

*The executive should file the report and a motion required by this proviso by November 1, 2019, in the form of a paper original and an electronic copy with the clerk of the council, who shall retain the original and provide an electronic copy to all councilmembers, the council chief of staff and the lead staff for the budget and fiscal management committee, or its successor.*

An additional $250,000 was appropriated to the hiring incentive pilot program in the 2019 First Supplemental Omnibus[[2]](#footnote-2) for a total of $519,000 to date*.*

**ANALYSIS**

Ordinance 18835 required DAJD to transmit a report by November 1, 2019 that includes the specific requirements as specified by the proviso presented above. Listed below is DAJD’s response to each proviso requirement as outlined in the report (Attachment A).

**Description of Incentive Program**

As stated in the report, DAJD developed three tiers of incentives and the criteria for each tier. The three tiers for incentives are 1) Lateral Hires, 2) Employee Referrals, and, 3) No Previous Experience (New Hires). New recruitments for both Corrections and Juvenile Detention Officers opened on January 14, 2019, at which point the new incentives were also implemented.

***Lateral Hires***

Lateral hires must have at least 12 months of combined corrections, law enforcement, or juvenile detention experience with any agency within the three years prior to application with DAJD. The executive states that lateral hires are of benefit to DAJD because their professional experience shortens the amount of training time required before they can begin working independently. Applicants with recognized lateral experiences are eligible for up to a $10,000 in hiring incentive payment, allocated in three amounts linked to meeting three distinct milestones:

* Milestone one - $2,500 at hiring;
* Milestone two - $2,500 upon successful completion of the state training academy; and
* Milestone three - $5,000 upon completion of the 12-month probationary period.

If lateral hires are separated from DAJD employment for non-medical reasons prior to completing three years of service, they are required to reimburse the $5,000 payment that they receive upon completion of probation. Once an individual is determined to be eligible for the lateral hire incentive payment, DAJD’s HR manager reviews the necessary documentation and makes the final approval for payment.

***New Hires***

Applicants in this group are eligible for up to $5,000 in hiring incentives, and similar to the lateral hires, the disbursement of the incentives happens after successful completion of three employment milestones:

* Milestone one - $1,250 is distributed at the time of hire;
* Milestone two - $1,250 is distributed upon successful completion of the state training academy, and;
* Milestone three - $2,500 is distributed upon successful completion of a 12-month probationary period.

If new hires are separated from employment for non-medical reasons prior to completing three years of service, they are required to reimburse the $2,500 payment that they receive upon completion of probation.

***Employee Referrals***

DAJD employees can receive up to $2,500 in incentive payments for successful recruitment of a new Corrections or Juvenile Detention Officer, divided into two payments; the first incentive payment of $1,250 is made when the new employee begins work with DAJD, and the second $1,250 payment is disbursed after the new employee successfully completes the 12-month probationary period. In order to encourage DAJD employees to continue to successfully refer candidates, there is no limit on the number of applicants that an employee can refer, nor a limit on the number of referral incentives they can receive. However, only one current employee can receive the incentive for referring a single new hire. The employee referral incentive is open only to members of the King County Corrections Guild, the King County Juvenile Detention Guild and the Washington State Council of County and City Employees. As with lateral hires, the DAJD HR Manager makes the final approval of incentive payments for the referral incentive as well.

A summary of each hiring incentive tier is provided in Table 1.

**Table 1. Hiring Incentive Tier Summary**

| **Tier** | **Milestone 1** | **Milestone 2** | **Milestone 3** | **Total** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Lateral Hires** | **$2,500**  at time of hire | **$2,500**  upon successful completion of state training academy | **$5,000**  uponsuccessful completion of 12-month probationary period | **$10,000** |
| **New Hires** | **$1,250**  at time of hire | **$1,250**  upon successful completion of state training academy | **$2,500**  upon successful completion of 12-month probationary period | **$5,000** |
| **Employee Referrals** | **$1,250**  at time of hire |  | **$1,250**  upon successful completion of 12-month probationary period | **$2,500** |

**Program Advertising Efforts**

The proviso also directs the Executive to provide a description of how the department advertised the program. Table 2 provides a brief overview of a few of the department’s efforts as indicated in the report.

**Table 2. Advertisements**

| **Advertising Engagement Tool** | **Outcome** |
| --- | --- |
| **Printed Materials[[3]](#footnote-3)** | 1. Development of a small card that existing employees can provide to prospective applicants which includes a quick response (QR) code with a link to the DAJD application page, and a space for the existing employee to write their name for the employee referral hiring incentive.  2. New recruiting flyer that includes updated wage information, resulting from the June 2019 King County Corrections Guild interest arbitration award, and adjustments to the minimum qualifications for the officers’ recruitment. |
| **Pandora Advertising Campaign[[4]](#footnote-4)** | Pandora airs DAJD recruiting advertisements between streaming songs. The advertisements reach listeners in King, Snohomish, Franklin, Mason, Pierce, Thurston and Walla Walla Counties in Washington State. The campaign targets counties with large correctional and detention facilities with the goal of attracting additional lateral hires as well as new officers. Also targeted are counties outside of the Puget Sound region where normal in-person recruiting efforts may not always reach. To date, the Pandora campaign has run 15,371 display advertisements and 153,238 audio advertisements. The estimated weekly audience is 230,394. |
| **Angel of the Winds Advertising  Campaign** | DAJD is developing a 12-month advertising campaign to be placed at the Angel of the Winds Arena in Everett. The campaign will utilize large dasher boards (the boards surrounding a hockey rink that regularly hold advertising), signage in the restrooms of the arena, and live LED advertisements during events such as open skate sessions and Everett Silvertips games. The printed material in this campaign will specifically mention hiring incentives. |

DAJD also has a plan to place advertising material on a select fleet of Washington State Ferries, which is expected to include 15 second advertisements that will be displayed on monitors around the decks while the ferries are in operation. Targeted routes include Seattle to Bainbridge, Seattle to Bremerton, Seattle to Vashon, Edmonds to Kingston, and Mukilteo to Clinton. Another DAJD advertising plan, as indicated in the report, is to work with a media partner who manages multiple Spanish language radio stations within the state to air audio advertisements. DAJD’s stated intent is to attract bilingual candidates as a result.

**Program Incentive Data**

***2019 Incentives and Referrals***

The proviso requires DAJD to provide the following, “For January 1, 2019, through September 30, 2019, the number of people who received each incentive, broken down to show laterals, new hires and referral bonuses.” According to the Executive, “When the hiring incentives program was initiated, the department determined that hiring incentives would begin with the Corrections and Juvenile Detention Officer recruitments that opened on January 14, 2019.” As stated in the report, DAJD hired 43 new Corrections Officers and 17 new Juvenile Detention Officers through the first nine months of 2019. In total for the same time period, the department paid $50,000 in incentives, starting in the 2nd quarter. The payments are broken down as follows:

* $20,000 paid to juvenile detention officers;
* $21,250 paid to new corrections officers; and,
* $8,750 paid to employees for successful employee referrals.

Although these numbers provide valuable information on the total amount of incentives paid during the specific reporting period, they do not satisfy the proviso requirement of providing a breakdown of the number of people who received each incentive, broken down to show laterals, new hires, and referral bonuses for both Corrections and Juvenile Detention Officers. Council staff is working with the department to gather this information, therefore, staff analysis is ongoing.

***2018 Incentives and Referrals***

In 2018, DAJD hired 25 new Corrections Officers and 14 new Juvenile Detention Officers. If the pilot program had been in place in 2018, none of the officers hired in that calendar year would have been eligible for the lateral incentives due to the absence of prior experience necessary to qualify as a lateral hire. Again, to qualify as a lateral hire, an officer must have at least 12 months of combined corrections, law enforcement or juvenile detention experience within the three years prior to applying with DAJD. Therefore, all of the hires in 2018 would have only been eligible for the “new hire” incentives.

In January 2019, DAJD added a “referred by” field to the job application where applicants can identify referral source by name. Prior to adding this data element, DAJD did not gather referral data and is therefore unable to determine how many referral bonuses would have been paid if the program was in place in 2018. In 2019, there have been 234 applications that indicated a referral by a current DAJD employee.

**Performance Metrics**

As stated by the Executive, “The goals of the hiring incentives program are to increase hiring and retention of officers while reducing vacancies and the use of overtime.” To measure progress toward achieving these goals, the department is tracking and evaluating a number of performance measures, including cost per participant, impact on officer vacancies, overtime hours, and mandatory overtime hours. At the time the report was submitted, the data was as follows:

***Cost per participant***

As of September 30, 2019, DAJD had hired 43 new Correctional officers and paid $21,250 in incentives for an average cost per hire of approximately $494. As of September 30, 2019, DAJD had hired 17 new Juvenile Detention officers and paid $20,000 in incentives for an average cost per new hire of approximately $1,176.

***Impact on officer vacancies, overtime hours and mandatory overtime hours***

The following two tables provide data on vacancies, overtime and mandatory overtime hours for adult corrections and juvenile detention officers, respectively. Table 3 focuses specifically on Adult Corrections Officers from January 2019 through August 2019. As stated in the report, “Please note that the numbers of officer vacancies in the table below reflect what is documented in DAJD’s Roster Management System on the first day of each month. Additions and separations can happen on any day of the month, and therefore is a constantly changing number”.

**Table 3. Adult Correctional Officer Vacancies**

| **Adult Division** | | | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Month** | **Vacancies** | **Overtime Hours** | **Mandatory Overtime Hours** |
| January | 32 | 8,427 | 5,855 |
| February | 18 | 8,400 | 2,820 |
| March | 21 | 10,503 | 4,416 |
| April | 27 | 9,687 | 5,423 |
| May | 27 | 9,944 | 3,309 |
| June | 31 | 10,806 | 4,514 |
| July | 33 | 9,144 | 4,574 |
| August | 21 | 8,944 | 8,602 |

While officer vacancies have consistently been identified as a contributor to high levels of overtime, Table 3 shows that even when vacancies were at their lowest points during the reporting period, overtime hours did not decrease by much when compared to months when vacancies were at their highest points. For instance, in January there were 32 vacancies and a total of 8,427 overtime hours (5,855 mandatory). The following month, there were 18 vacancies reported and a total of 8,400 overtime hours (2,820 mandatory). In response to this observation, executive staff stated, “DAJD is tracking other suspected overtime contributors such as compensatory time usage, increased leave use, widespread use of Family and Medical Leave Act (FMLA) restrictions and long term hospital guarding. The intricacies of the relative weight of each contributor is unclear and something that DAJD continues to monitor.”

Table 4 below shows a breakdown of Juvenile Detention Officer Vacancies and overtime hours, including mandatory overtime hours for the reporting period.

**Table 4. Juvenile Detention Officer Vacancies**

| **Juvenile Division** | | | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Month** | **Vacancies** | **Overtime Hours** | **Mandatory Overtime Hours** |
| January | 12 | 3,789 | 798 |
| February | 15 | 2,799 | 292 |
| March | 15 | 3,259 | 359 |
| April | 14 | 2,832 | 278 |
| May | 14 | 3,318 | 493 |
| June | 14 | 3,090 | 403 |
| July | 15 | 3,099 | 612 |
| August | 15 | 3,483 | 694 |

***2018-2019 Vacancies Comparison***

The report states that in 2018, DAJD hired 25 new Corrections Officers and is on track to more than double that amount in 2019. As of September 30, 2019 the department reported it had also hired 17 Juvenile Detention Officers as compared to 14 in all of 2018. Although new hires in the Juvenile Division at the time exceeded 2018 hires, the executive stated that there is still a large number of vacant Juvenile Detention Officer positions. This is mainly due to the adding of 13 additional positions being added at the end of 2018.

***Other Potential Avoided System Costs***

The Executive states in the report that while it is difficult to know all avoided system costs that result from hiring individuals eligible for program incentives, the anticipated major avoided cost would be reduced overtime expenses attributable to lower staff vacancies and more officers available to work shifts. Per the Executive, “While somewhat intangible and not easily measured, by bringing on more officers, DAJD is able to better support employees to avoid burnout and experience increased employee satisfaction. In turn, it is expected that decreased officer burnout and better job satisfaction outcomes for DAJD staff will likely lead to greater officer retention as well. The impact of reducing mandatory overtime in particular could greatly improve employee morale.”

**Recommendation to Continue Hiring Incentives**

Finally, the proviso calls for the executive to provide a recommendation of whether the program should continue in 2020, and if the program is recommended to be continued, to also provide a program cost estimate for 2020 and any recommended changes to make the program more effective. In response, executive staff stated in the report, “Based on DAJD’s hiring successes to date and the key role that the hiring incentive program has played in recruitment and hiring of new officers, the Executive recommends continuing the hiring incentives program through 2020.”

The average hiring process timeline for new Corrections Officers is 85 days, and the hiring process for new Juvenile Detention Officers averages 100 days. Therefore, the first eligible recruitment class didn’t officially begin until July 2019. As a result, executive staff has stated that additional data and time are needed to further evaluate the pilot program’s success. DAJD anticipates that a higher number of incentives in each category will be paid in 2020 as more employees achieve the milestones of completing academy training and probation. The department estimates that it will need to hire 40-50 new corrections officers in 2020 to fill vacancies, including those due to attrition. The department anticipates spending $275,000 in 2020 for incentive payments, based on the following:

* $25,000 for employee referrals (10 referrals at $2,500 each)
* $100,000 for lateral hires (10 at $10,000 each)
* $150,000 for new hires (30 at $5,000 each)

DAJD did not identify any changes needed for the pilot.

The transmitted report generally meets the requirements of the proviso. The proposed motion, if passed by Council, would acknowledge receipt of the report and allow the provisoed funds restricted by the proviso to be expended.

**INVITED**

* John Diaz, Director, Department of Adult and Juvenile Detention
* Peter Hu, Human Resources Manager, Department of Adult and Juvenile Detention

**ATTACHMENTS**

1. Proposed Motion 2019-0460
   1. Attachment A: Department of Adult and Juvenile Detention Hiring Incentives Pilot Project Report
2. Transmittal Letter

1. Adopted November 13, 2018. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Ordinance 18930, Adopted June 26, 2019. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. The DAJD recruiting team distributes the printed materials at recruitment events and career fairs. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. As stated in the report, “At the conclusion of the campaign, Pandora will be able to share key metrics with the department, such as how many times the advertising has resulted in follow-up by the listeners. The report indicates, “While it may be difficult to determine whether the audio or display advertising ultimately drives new candidates to the department, the campaign will be heard by a wide audience.” [↑](#footnote-ref-4)